

CITATION (2004) 4 KLR

ISSN 1117-0530

# **KINGS LAW REPORTS**

## **(ALL SC/NOVEL CA)**

**(2004) KLR VOL 4 PART 174 pp. 719 - 866**

**APRIL 2004**

**Dedicated to the King of kings**

**O. O. NOEL ESQ. Chief Editor**

### **INDEX OF CASES REPORTED**

1. Esiaga v. University of Calabar p. 719
2. Odi v. Iyala p. 741
3. Aiguokhian v. The State (Edo State) p. 771
4. Royal Ade Nigeria Ltd v. National Oil and Chemical Marketing Company PLC p. 781
5. Leadway Assurance Ltd v. Zeco Nigeria Ltd p. 803

### **COURT OF APPEAL**

1. Okonkwo v. Independent National Electoral Commission p. 817 CA

ii **INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2004) 4 KLR**

ACTIONS - Reliefs - University - Administrative law - Relief for an order to be made in future - About releasing the results of examinations that have not been taken - Should not be granted (H4) Esiaga v. University of Calabar p. 719

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW - Judicial powers - University - Garba's case - Is not meant to provide a cover for bad students - Effort of the respondents in this case - Towards arresting a perceived evil - Is not assumption of powers of the court (H3) Esiaga v. University of Calabar p. 719

ADMINISTRATIVE LAW - University Authority - Cult system and rampaging acts of students - Should be curbed by the Authority - By suspending perpetrators of evil (H2) Esiaga v. University of Calabar p. 719

APPEALS - Concurrent findings - Borne out from the evidence - Will not be interfered with (H11) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

APPEALS - Concurrent findings - Not shown to be perverse - Will not be disturbed (H4) Leadway Assurance Ltd v. Zeco Ltd p. 803

APPEALS - Retrial order - Will not be made by appellate court - Where plaintiff's case has completely failed (H10) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

COURTS - Evidence - Evaluation of - Scale of justice - Is where the trial judge will place an evidence - And give judgment in favour of the party - Where the evidence tilts favourably (H4) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

CRIMINAL LAW - Defence of mistake - The story must be true - Not an insult to intelligence - And should not arise from lack of proper care - To warrant a relief from criminal liability (H1) Aiguokhian v. State p. 771

CRIMINAL LAW - Murder - Defence of mistake - Test of honest belief

- Does not avail the appellant - As his story is bizarre and an affront to intelligence (H2) Aiguokhian v. State p. 771

CRIMINAL PROCEDURE - Murder - Confessional statement of accused  
- And his evidence in court - Show that he intended to kill the deceased (H4) Aiguokhian v. State p. 771

ESTOPPEL - Res judicata - Where raised in the briefs of appeal - Instead of the pleadings - It will be disregarded (H1) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

EVIDENCE - Appeals - Reevaluating the evidence unto reaching a different conclusion - Was properly done by lower court (H3) Royal Ade Ltd v. National Oil PLC p. 781

EVIDENCE - Carriage of goods - Courts - Uncontradicted evidence - That plaintiff reported its loss to defendant - Within the 21 days contractual term - Was rightly acted upon by the trial court (H3) Leadway Assurance Ltd v. Zeco Ltd p. 803

EVIDENCE - Insurance - Unchallenged evidence - Evidence of report of claim to defendant - Is unchallenged - As concurrently found by the lower courts (H2) Leadway Assurance Ltd v. Zeco Ltd p. 803

EVIDENCE - Witnesses - Hostile witness s. 207 E.A. - Plaintiffs' failure at trial - To treat PW3's contrary evidence as hostile - Cannot be corrected on appeal (H3) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

INSURANCE - Pleadings - Issue of oral report of claim - Was pleaded - Contrary to defendant's contention (H1) Leadway Assurance Ltd v. Zeco Ltd p. 803

LAND LAW - Ownership - Where parties make opposing claims to land - Evidence of a third party ownership - Destroys the plaintiff's case (H2) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

LAND LAW - Title - Non-suit - Plaintiff that claims ownership of land - Must prove his title in any of the five ways - And he is not entitled to non-suit - To repair his original case (H9) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

MURDER - Intention to kill - Is established against appellant - Regardless of his story (H3) Aiguokhian v. State p. 771

PLEADINGS - Binding effect of - Reliance on plaintiff's contrary evidence - In finding against him - Does not destroy the principle of binding effect of pleadings (H5) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

PLEADINGS - Value of - Land law - Traditional history - Failure to trace the original owner - In genealogical tree down to plaintiffs vide pleadings - Destroyed their case (H6) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Non-suit - Appeals - Burden is on plaintiff to prove - That trial judge ought to have entered a non-suit - Dismissal was rightly entered in the present case (H8) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Non-suit order - Meaning of - Where neither party will be entitled to judgment - Court can enter a non-suit (H7) Odi v. Iyala p. 741

TORTS - Equitable maxims - Res ipsa loquitur - Negligence - When the maxim may operate (H2) Royal Ade Ltd v. National Oil PLC p. 781

TORTS - Negligence - Damages - Three things plaintiff must prove - To be entitled to damages (H1) Royal Ade Ltd v. National Oil PLC p. 781

TORTS - Negligence - Fire Accident - Res ipsa loquitur plea - Existence of evidence - That excused respondent from negligence - Has defeated the claim for damages (H4) Royal Ade Ltd v. National Oil PLC p. 781

WORDS & PHRASES - “Suspension” - Fair hearing - Administrative law  
- The term suspension means waiting until a certain event takes place - So that an investigating body - Was yet to be set up to hear the appellant (H1) Esiaga v. University of Calabar p. 719

**COURT OF APPEAL**

ACTIONS - Competence - Jurisdiction - Issue of - Interlocutory injunction motion - Though filed before the motion challenging court’s jurisdiction - Issue of jurisdiction was rightly considered first (H4) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

APPEALS - Finding of trial court - Issues - Not arising from appellant’s grounds of appeal - Should not be argued by the respondent - Appellate court will not disturb a finding - That is not challenged (H7) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

APPEALS - New point - Can only be made a ground of appeal - With leave of court (H2) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

APPEALS - Notice of appeal - Contradiction therein that is misleading - Makes it hollow - And the appeal based on it is incompetent (H3) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

ELECTION PETITIONS - Competence of - Demurrer - Irregularity of a petition - Is governed by sub-paragraph 49(5) of the Procedure for Election Petitions - Issue of demurrer raised by appellant - Is unprofitable and diversionary (H1) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

ELECTION PETITIONS - Prescribed procedure - Where appellants petition violates the prescribed procedure - Discretion exercised in striking it out is proper (H8) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

ELECTION PETITIONS - Validity - Capacity - Where a petition is incur-

vi **INDEX OF SUBJECT MATTER IN (2004) 4 KLR CA**

ably bad - Considering the standing in which it is presented - Is irrelevant (H10) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

ELECTION PETITIONS - Validity of - Appellant's failure to obtain the Tribunal's approval - Before filing his petition - Will not per se invalidate it (H9) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

JURISDICTION - Lack of - Injunction - Motion for interlocutory injunction - Insisting that it to be heard - And motion challenging competence of action be struck out - Is wrong - As court that lacks jurisdiction - Cannot exercise any power in respect of such matter (H5) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

PRACTICE & PROCEDURE - Motions - Jurisdiction - Priority of taking pending motions in a case - Date of filing is irrelevant - Where issue of jurisdiction is raised - In the later motion (H6) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

**INDEX OF STATUTES & RULES**

Constitution of Nigeria 1979 s. 33(1), (2) and (4) Esiaga v. University of Calabar p. 719

Criminal Code ss. 28, 25 Aiguokhian v. State p.771

University of Calabar Act (Cap. 453) Laws of Nigeria 1990 ss. 17, 17(2) Esiaga v. University of Calabar p. 719

### **COURT OF APPEAL**

Electoral Act, 2002, ss. 133(1)(a) (b), 134(1)(a)-(d), 136(3), and sub-paragraphs, 4(6), 4(1)(a) of the First Schedule to the Act Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

Court of Appeal Act, Cap. 75 of the Laws of Federation of Nigeria, 1990, s. 25(1) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

Court of Appeal Rules, 2002 Order 3, sub-rules 2(1) & (7) Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

Federal High Court (Civil procedure) Rules 2000 O. 25 rr. 1, 2(1)(2), O. 12 r.8 Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA

Procedure for Election Petitions paragraph 50 Okonkwo v. INEC p. 817 CA